

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
August 8, 2024 at 7:30PM – Meeting Minutes

A recording of this meeting is available on the Village of Oak Park Website: <https://www.oak-park.us/your-government/citizen-commissions/commission-tv>

Roll Call

Present: Chair Lou Garapolo and Commissioners Amy Peterson, David Bates, Scot Mazur, Paul Ribera, Ron Roman, and Mark Weiner, and Rachel Michelin
Absent: Commissioner Jessica Paul
Staff: Craig Failor, Village Planner / Planning and Urban Design Manager

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Roman to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Bates. Motion approved 8-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to approve the minutes from July 11, 2024. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 8-0.

Regular Agenda

HPC2024-16: 150 N Lombard Ave (Osman Galvez & Elisabeth Carlson), Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District: Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a bay (bump-out) on the second floor above the side entry.

Chair Garapolo introduced the item. Village Planner Failor provided a staff summary indicating consideration should be given regarding the request as it would be change not identified on any other sister build in the area.

The item was opened for discussion by Commissioner Peterson and seconded by Michelin.

Jim Vanderheyden, the architect, was present. He provided photographs of the existing house and elevations and floor plans of the proposed modifications. Mr. Vanderheyden indicated it would only be a 12-inch bump out to accommodate two bathrooms. The architect also stated that the window design changed from the original design to an upper half only awning-type window. The homeowner, Mr. Os Galvez provided commentary on his reasons for the half window design.

Commissioner Peterson was concerned that the addition would change the character of the house. She felt the reduced window size was not in keeping with the current window size and pattern. Homeowner Galvez indicated they wished for enhanced privacy for the bathrooms.

Commissioner Roman also felt the addition would change the character of the house. He suggested interior modifications to make up for the bump out.

Commissioner Michelin inquired if smaller modifications were considered. The architect indicated that it would create a very tight area.

Commissioner Weiner was fine with both modification by the architect; bump out and half windows.

Commissioner Ribera was supportive of the bump out but not the half windows.

Chair Garapolo supported the full double hung window design originally proposed, but did not feel the bump out was appropriate. He suggested a review be made by the Architectural Review Committee.

The Commission conducted a straw poll of its members relative to the bump out and the window design as follows;

Support the proposed 12-inch bump out:

Yes: Commissioners Mazer, Weiner, Bates, Ribera and Peterson

No: Commissioners Roman, Michelin and Chair Garapolo

Support the half window design:

Yes: Commissioners Mazer, Weiner, Roman, and Bates

No: Commissioners Michelin, Ribera, Peterson and Chair Garapolo

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the project with full sized double-hung windows. Second by Commissioner Weiner. Motion approved 5-3 vote as follows.

AYE: Commissioners Peterson, Weiner, Mazur, Bates and Ribera

NAY: Commissioners Roman, Michelin and Chair Garapolo

HPC2024-17: 631 Forest Ave (Anthony & Candice Drew), Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District: Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an addition of a one-story screen-in porch.

Chair Garapolo introduced the item. Village Planner Failor provided a staff summary indicating consideration should be given to the screened porch window design.

The item was opened for discussion by Commissioner Roman and seconded by Michelin.

Jim Vanderheyden, the architect, was present. He provided photographs of the existing house, house proposed with the approved additions and elevations and floor plans of the proposed modifications. Mr. Vanderheyden indicated it in keeping with the previous discussions for a greater setback from the front and allowed recognition of the original bungalow house.

Commissioner Roman inquired as to the length of the proposed screened porch windows. Architect Vanderheyden indicated it would be approximately floor to ceiling.

Commissioner Michelin asked about the inside doorway design and drainage. The architect indicated that the inside doorway has not been designed yet, but was suggesting a French doorway. He also indicated that the floor would be slightly sloped to allow drainage.

Commissioner Peterson indicated she was supportive of the size and location, but suggested that the lower treatment be modified.

Chair Garapolo was very concerned that based on the Commission's previous discussion and approvals regarding side and second story additions the proposed screened porch would significantly compromise the front yard setback agreement. The proposed addition would change the whole concept of the previous addition by moving the building line forward. Chair Garapolo was not in favor of this proposal.

Commissioner Peterson agreed that Chair Garapolo made a valid point about the front setback.

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the project. Second by Commissioner Weiner. Motion was denied by a 0-8 vote as follows.

AYE: None

NAY: Commissioners Peterson, Weiner, Roman, Michelin, Mazur, Bates, Ribera and Chair Garapolo

HPC2024-18: 110 S Elmwood Ave (Levia Hoppszallern), Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District: Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear addition.

Chair Garapolo introduced the item. Village Planner Failor provided a staff summary indicating consideration should be given regarding the proposed window design along the south elevation addition.

The item was opened for discussion by Commissioner Peterson and seconded by Mazur.

Frank Michalski, the architect, was present. He provided photographs of the existing house and elevations and floor plans of the proposed modifications. Mr. Michalski indicated the changes were to accommodate necessary accessible modifications for the homeowner as well as additional needed floor space.

Commissioner Peterson inquired why the proposed windows did not match the existing tall narrow windows prominent on the exterior of the house. The architect indicated that more light was desired and tall narrow windows were not the current style. Commissioner Peterson stated that the windows should match as long as the building codes would allow.

Commissioner Roman asked about the small bump out on the south side eave area. The homeowner, Ms. Hoppszallern indicated it was originally part of a staircase and would be removed during renovation / construction.

Commissioner Michelin asked if the exterior siding would be the same material as the existing. The Architect indicated it would as well as the same profile.

Chair Garapolo stated that the proposed addition would be in good alignment and the proposed dormers compliments the view. He agreed the window should be modified supporting Commissioner Peterson's recommendation.

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the project with tall narrow windows replicating existing windows from the header down provided building codes can be met. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 8-0 vote as follows.

AYE: Commissioners Peterson, Mazur, Weiner, Bates, Ribera, Roman, Michelin and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

Advisory Review: 623 Forest Ave (Max Kenworthy), Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District: Advisory Review for proposed new garage on the site of a previous, non-historic garage.

The applicant and homeowner, Mr. Kenworth provided an overview of his proposal to construct a new garage in a style similar to the existing house.

Chair Garapolo complemented the homeowner on his house and suggested that the window on the proposed garage have the same detailing as the windows on the house.

The advisory review was approved by the commissioners. Staff will follow up with a letter

Other Business

New Commissioner Rachel Michelin was welcomed by Chair Garapolo.

Village Planner Failor indicated that interviews are underway for the Urban Planner position.

It was suggested that staff provide a written explanation from the HPC attorney on their voting protocol.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Michelin to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Roman.

The meeting adjourned at 9:26 PM.

Minutes prepared by Craig Failor, Village Planner / Planning & Urban Design Manager.