

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
October 9, 2014 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Vice Chair Gary Palese, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Fred Brandstrader, Don McLean, Dan Moroney, Regina Nally, Chris Payne, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Tony Quinn
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Albrecht to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by McLean. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Albrecht to approve the September 11, 2014 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Nally. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. HPC 2014-36: 1013 Superior Street (Wood): Public Hearing for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct three roof additions [under construction] (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Property owner Dr. Antony Wood was present.

Chair McGrath opened the public hearing and provided an overview of the public hearing process.

Richard Friedman, attorney with the firm of Neal and Leroy and representing the Village of Oak Park, asked that anyone wishing to speak during the public hearing be sworn in.

The court reporter swore in all those in attendance that wished to speak during the public hearing.

Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner with the Village of Oak Park, read the list of exhibits.

Dr. Antony Wood, property owner of 1013 Superior Street, made a presentation to the Commission. He provided an overview of the permit process and his permit submittal documents. He showed photographs of the property before and after completion of the work, as well as photographs of other houses on the block. He noted that he disagreed with expert witness Mr. Timothy Wittman, who prepared a report on behalf of the Village of Oak Park.

Mr. Friedman and members of the Commission questioned Dr. Wood.

Dr. Wood noted that he completed the project so as not to leave the construction incomplete for three months, as he was out of the country. He noted that his house is not a Historic Landmark and that he felt his submittal met the review criteria in the Village's Architectural Review Guidelines.

October 9, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

The Commission discussed issues with the Village's review process regarding this permit application as well as issues with the permit submittal documents.

Mr. Timothy Wittman, an expert witness for the Village of Oak Park and resident of Chicago, provided his qualifications and gave an overview of his report regarding the Contributing status of the house within the historic district and his opinion on the changes that were made. He testified that the changes resulted in an adverse affect on the historic character of the house or the historic district.

Jason Zubkis, 1033 Superior Street, testified in support of Dr. Wood's application.

Daniel Groves, 1016 Superior Street, testified in support of Dr. Wood's application.

Dr. Wood testified that he was shellshocked by the Village's use of an attorney and expert witness and their costs to the taxpayers of Oak Park. He felt that the Village's response to his application was out of proportion for the scope of work, and that there were numerous issues with the permit review process.

Chair McGrath closed the evidence portion of the public hearing.

Motion by Moroney to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 1013 Superior Street. Second by Albrecht.

Commissioner Moroney stated that he supports the application. The review is subjective and the house is not a historic resource in his opinion. The applicant was given a permit by the Village and succeeded in improving his house. He stated that it is important to consider the opinion of local residents over an expert from Chicago.

Commissioner Nally noted that there were missteps throughout the permit process by both the Village and the applicant. Although the Commission's review did not happen in a timely manner, the outcome may have been different had the Commission had the opportunity to review the project prior to its construction and the applicant an opportunity to present it to them.

Commissioner Albrecht stated that the Commission is in an unfortunate position and discussed the Contributing status of the property. He weighed the requirement of the applicant to rebuild the roof versus the issues which occurred with the permit review process.

Chair McGrath noted that alterations and additions to historic houses are approved by the Commission frequently within the framework of the Architectural Review Guidelines. She stated that the changes made on this property met did not meet the Guidelines in her opinion.

Commissioner Palese agreed that the work does not meet the Guidelines in his opinion. He noted his concern on setting a precedent if the application is approved. In his opinion the house is a Contributing Resource within the historic district and the completed work was different from what was submitted.

Commissioner Sundling stated that it is disconcerting to him that the process faltered. Both the Village's review process and the applicant's submittal documents were inappropriate. A preliminary discussion between the Commission and applicant would likely have resulted in a solution for all. It is a difficult position for the Commission to decide for rebuilding the roof or compromising on their Guidelines.

October 9, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Commissioner McLean did not agree that an approval would set a precedent, as there were enough errors made on both sides during the process to make the application unique.

Commissioner Payne stated that he often agrees with Mr. Wittman's opinions, but the process on this application was flawed. He is also concerned about setting a precedent.

Mr. Friedman and Mr. Kaarre outlined the applicant's options should the application be denied. They included requesting a Certificate of Economic Hardship, appealing the decision to the Village Board of Trustees, or revise the application to meet the Guidelines.

Motion by Albrecht to continue the public hearing to the next Commission meeting on November 13 to allow the Commission to review and approve a Resolution and Findings of Fact. Second by Nally. Motion approved 9-0.

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath
NAY: None*

Commissioner Brandstrader joined the meeting at 9:55 p.m.

**B. Historic Landmark: Preliminary Determination of Eligibility for the following:
1010 Fair Oaks Avenue, I.M. Fixman House, Donald F. Gibbs/Schurecht Development, 1953**

Mr. Kaarre provided an overview of the application.

Motion by Nally that the Commission determine that the property at 1010 Fair Oaks Avenue meets one or more criteria for designation as a Historic Landmark. Second by Albrecht.

The Commission discussed the nomination report and noted their support of the designation.

Motion approved 10-0.

*AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath
NAY: None*

**C. HPC 2014-59: 325 S. Scoville Avenue (Raidl): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a side dormer (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)
Architect Errol Kirsch was present representing the property owner.**

Mr. Kaarre provided an overview of the application, which involves the construction of a dormer without a building permit or Certificate of Appropriateness.

Errol Kirsch, the architect for the project, provided an overview of the project history regarding the attic remodel and construction of a gabled dormer with the proper Historic or Village permit review. He met several times with the Commission's Architectural Review Committee, and they proposing to alter the dormer to a hipped-roof design which matches the existing front dormer that is smaller and set further back from the eaves.

The Commission discussed the application and noted that the project as revised meets the Guidelines.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 325 S. Scoville Avenue as revised. Second by Brandstrader. Motion approved 10-0.

October 9, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

Commissioner Sundling stated that he is recusing himself from discussion and voting on the Certificate of Appropriateness applications for 738 Belleforte Avenue and 608 N. Marion Street.

- D. HPC 2014-64: 738 Belleforte Avenue (Smith): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct two dormer additions (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Architect Patrick Magner was present representing the property owner.

Mr. Kaarre provided an overview of the application to construct two dormers.

Patrick Magner, Magner-Manalang Architects, is the architect for the project. He noted that the house has been added on to over the years and was completely altered by a developer in 2002.

The Commission discussed the Contributing status of the property and requested that Staff follow up on the changes to the property and whether the status should be changed. They noted that the project as proposed meets the Guidelines.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 738 Belleforte Avenue as submitted. Second by Brandstrader. Motion approved 10-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

- E. HPC 2014-65: 608 N. Marion Street (Sundling): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a rear two-car garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Property owner Tom Sundling was present.

Mr. Kaarre provided an overview of the application to demolish a rear one-story garage and construct a rear two-story garage.

Tom Sundling, the property owner, provided an overview of the garage's condition, including sagging walls and a rotted wall plate constructed directly on a concrete slab with no foundation. He noted that the second floor height is minimized by using low kneewalls and hipped roofs. The new garage will be clad with cedar clapboard siding to match the house.

Motion by Brandstrader to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 608 N. Marion Street as submitted. Second by Albrecht.

The Commission discussed the condition of the existing garage and the relationship of the new garage to the neighboring property. They noted that the project as proposed meets the Guidelines.

Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Chair McGrath
NAY: None
RECUSED: Sundling

F. Hulbert Subdivision: Discuss outreach approach for potential designations

Planner Kaarre stated that the 2014 Commission Work Plan includes a proposal to provide outreach to property owners within the Hulbert Subdivision located on the 500-800 blocks of Clinton and S. Kenilworth Avenues in seeking support for the creation of a National Register Historic District. Recognizing and protecting this area of the Village has been discussed by the Commission for many years, and was prioritized in the 2010 Strategic Historic Preservation Plan. It's location adjacent to the I-290 Eisenhower Expressway has also brought the issue to the fore, with direction from the Village Board to look potential preservation options along the I-290 corridor.

The Commission's Education Committee has been discussing the item and is requesting support from the full Commission on including this item in the 2015 Commission Work Plan and amending the item to include outreach on designating the area as an Oak Park historic district as well as listing it on the National Register. The outreach would provide information to property owners on the pros and cons of local designation and National Register listing, and would include a public meeting.

The Commission discussed the proposal and agreed with the Education Committee that both local designation and National Register listing should be discussed together, and directed Staff to make the appropriate changes to the Work Plan.

CONSENT AGENDA

OTHER BUSINESS

Architectural Review Guidelines: The Commission agreed to add a request for funding in the amount of \$4,000 to the 2015 Commission Work Plan to allow consultant Preservation Design Consultants to complete the remaining sections of the revised Guidelines.

Robert's Rules of Order: Chair McGrath provided an overview of Commission meeting procedures.

Certificate of Appropriateness application: Chair McGrath noted that she has been working with Staff to update the application to include a list of submittal requirements on it. A draft will be provided at the November meeting.

ADJOURN

Motion by Battaglia to adjourn. Second by Sundling. Motion approved 10-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 10:55 p.m.