

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
September 12, 2013 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Joerg Albrecht, Garret Eakin, Frank Heitzman, Regina Nally, Gary Palese, Tony Quinn
ABSENT: Greg Battoglia, Drew Niermann, Tom Sundling
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP – Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Heitzman to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 6-0.
AYE: Albrecht, Heitzman, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Palese to approve the August 8, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Nally. Motion approved 6-0.
AYE: Albrecht, Heitzman, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

Commissioner Eakin arrived.

A. **HPC 13-22: 721 Fair Oaks Avenue (Moroney) – Certificate of Appropriateness for a new front porch (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The two-story stucco house was constructed in 1919 by Thilo H. Toll. The Colonial Revival style house is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. The proposal is to replace the front stoop with a full-width front porch. The proposal does not meet the Porch Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines as the proposed porch is not in keeping with the style of the house. Staff is not recommending approval.

Liz Moroney, 721 Fair Oaks Avenue, is the property owner. She is a realtor and feels a new porch would add balance and symmetry to the house, which is not symmetrical.

Motion by Palese to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 721 Fair Oaks Avenue as submitted. Second by Nally.

Commissioner Heitzman stated that it is true the house is not symmetrical and is not a great example of the Colonial Revival style. However, the existing entry is symmetrical with the windows. Adding a full-width porch won't change the symmetry of the house.

Commissioner Eakin concurs with the staff report. The design is founded in the Colonial Revival style. Its asymmetry does not make it bad. He does not support the proposal.

Commissioner Palese stated that the proposed porch would make it look more like a farmhouse, and would ruin the aesthetic of the Colonial Revival style home.

Commissioner Nally stated that the existing portico is the most character-defining feature, which is possibly altered, yet it is a nice entryway. The house defines as Colonial Revival. Adding a large porch roof which removes that will lose the primary character-defining feature. Some houses in the style had verandas vs. a covered porch. That could provide that front yard experience.

Liz Moroney provided examples of other homes she felt were Colonial Revival which have porches.

Planner Kaarre provided an overview of the Colonial Revival style and porch types in the district.

Chair McGrath suggested looking at a slightly larger porch keeping within the style.

Commissioner Albrecht stated that the Guidelines don't allow a full porch addition.

The Commission took no action on the Certificate of Appropriateness application. They recommended retaining the existing, possibly original, entry surround. Replacing the front stairs and railings is acceptable under the Guidelines and would only require review by Staff. If a more substantial porch is desired, consider a smaller porch centered on the entry door with a design in keeping with the Colonial Revival style of the house.

B. **HPC 13-23: 210 S. Kenilworth Avenue (Venturelli) – Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear two-story addition, siding, porch, windows, garage (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The two-story frame house was constructed c. 1890 as it appears on the 1895 Sanborn map. The gable-front house is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. The proposal involves the exterior restoration of the siding, repair of the front porch and wood windows; construction of a rear two-story addition and porch, and rehabilitation of the garage. The proposal meets the Architectural Review Guidelines and staff is recommending approval as submitted.

Motion by Heitzman to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 210 S. Kenilworth Avenue as submitted. Second by Albrecht.

Commissioner McGrath stated that they did an excellent job. It's a large addition yet appropriate.

Commissioner Heitzman stated that it will be a great improvement.

Commissioner Eakin stated that there are a lot of great details, especially with removing the asphalt siding and restoration of the original siding.

Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

C. **HPC 13-24: 702 N. Elmwood Avenue (Kiker) – Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear/side porch addition, three new dormers, new two-story bay (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The two-story stucco house was constructed in 1911 by L. R. Laughlin for C. B. Ford. The Prairie-influence house is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. The proposal includes construction of a porch that wraps around the rear and south side, demolition of the existing two-story bay and construction of a larger two-story bay, the addition of three dormers on the east (rear) north and south roof slopes. The proposal does not meet the New Addition Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines and Staff is not recommending approval.

Derrick Kiker, 702 N. Elmwood, stated that they love the street, neighbors and owning a corner property. They want more articulation on the south façade which will add additional space while keeping the character of the house. Their motivation is to expand the kitchen, a second-floor bedroom and the attic, but they are open to considering alternatives.

Amias Turman, Airoom Architects, stated that they appreciate the job of the HPC maintaining the character of Oak Park. There are a diversity of people who want to express their individuality. They are maintaining the details of the house without detracting from the neighborhood.

Greg Sutton, Airoom Architects, stated that he is the designer. A lot of corner houses have side articulations. This is a plain box. They want to remodel the kitchen and add space. They are moving the bay further out, though not making it wider. The second floor of the bay expands a bedroom.

Motion by Palese to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 702 N. Elmwood Avenue as submitted. Second by Eakin.

The Commission discussed the design of the south dormer, the bay and how the porch meets the bay. Some were concerned about the dormer size and appearance, in how it connects with the two-story bay below. The HPC was supportive of the rear porch expansion as submitted.

The Commission took no action on the Certificate of Appropriateness application and recommended the following:

- Consider alterations to the south dormer design, such as the roof shape and height of the dormer and windows, to make it more compatible with the design of the house.
- Consider alterations to the two-story bay addition/expansion, such as retention of the original shape of the bay, and simplification of the roof, as well as rethinking the connection of the bay, main roof, and dormer. One of the main concerns of the HPC was this vertical composition and how the individual elements interacted as a whole.
- Consider meeting with the Architectural Review Committee on September 25 to receive feedback on alternatives.

D. HPC 2014 Work Plan – Finalize 2014 work plan and budget

The Commission reviewed and revised the proposed 2014 work plan and budget.

Motion by Albrecht to accept the 2014 HPC Work Plan as revised and forward to the Village Board of Trustees for approval. Second by Heitzman.

Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

Architectural Review Guidelines: Planner Kaarre provided an update on the revision process.

QR Code Plaque Program: Commissioner Heitzman stated that he would like to solicit volunteers to assist in researching properties for the plaques. He provided an overview of the program. It was suggested that it might be eligible for a CLG grant.

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 135 Staff permit reviews for August 2013.

ADJOURN

Motion by Palese to adjourn. Second by Quinn. Motion approved: 7-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2013\2013 Minutes\09-12-13 HPC Minutes.docx