



1-7e

Village President and Board of Trustees Study Session

Tuesday, January 3, 2006

6:30pm-7:30pm

Community Room 101

The President and Board of Trustees welcome you. This is a working session of the Village Board and no public comment will be taken.

Agenda

1. Review of Village Manager Search Firm for Request for Proposals

Adjourn to Regular Village Board Meeting at 7:30 pm
in Council Chambers



INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

Date: December 22, 2005
To: President David Pope and Village Board of Trustees
From: Frank Spataro, Human Resources Director
Copy: Carl Swenson, Village Manager; Lisa Shelley, Deputy Village Manager - Administration
Subject: Response to the Request for Proposals from Executive Search Firm Contractors

Ten contractors responded to the Request for Proposals (RFP) concerning the selection of an executive search firm to assist the President and Board of Trustees in selecting a Village Manager. The RFP was initially mailed to thirty-four executive search firms and later to three more firms. In addition, three firms who were not included among those contacted by the Village responded to the RFP. Eight contractors submitted proposals to the RFP that was released on December 2. The PAR Group had submitted a proposal prior to the December 2 release of the RFP and because of that, they did not respond directly to the RFP but have been included. One other contractor, DHR International, was not made aware of the opportunity until Tuesday afternoon of the December 20 deadline and submitted their proposal on Wednesday, December 22. Attachment 1 is a full list of firms contacted and responding to the RFP. In addition to the Village making the initial contact with the search firms, all of the firms that were on the distribution list with the exception of "D", "E" and "F" were sent a reminder via e-mail on Thursday, December 15 reminding them of the December 20 deadline for submitting a proposal.

Lisa Shelley, Deputy Village Manager, Greg Peters, Finance Director and I reviewed the proposals with regard to general criteria stated in the RFP. This application of the general criteria resulted in the proposals being grouped as stated below.

Group A: Bennett Yarger Associates, The Mercer Group, and Waters/Oldani Executive Recruitment.

Group B: PAR Group and CPS

Group C: Arcus, McPherson & Jacobson, Virchow Krause, DHR International, and Gerald Plock

Attachment 2 represents the application of the general criteria stated in the RFP for all ten firms. You have been provided with all ten responses to the RFP, and the RFP itself (Attachment 3) so that you can review the information that was requested in the RFP and the responses provided by the firms. Please do not hesitate to call me if you have any questions about the information presented below or in the attachments.

EXECUTIVE SEARCH FIRMS

ORIGINAL DISTRIBUTION LIST (1 TO 34)

	SEARCH FIRM	ADDRESS		CITY	ST	ZIP
1	Alliance Resource Consulting, LLC	One World Trade Center	Suite 420	Long Beach	CA	90831
2	Arcus, LLC	600 N. 2nd Street	Suite 100	Harrisburg	PA	17101
3	Avery Associates	3 1/2 N. Santa Cruz Avenue	Suite A	Los Gatos	CA	95030
4	Bennett Yarger Associates	23 Doctors Hill Drive	Suite 100	Scituate	MA	02066
5	Bob Murray & Associates	735 Sunrise Avenue	Suite 145	Roseville	CA	95661
6	CPS Executive Search	241 Lathrop Way		Sacramento	CA	95815
7	Gerald Plock Associates	7501 Stallion Circle		Flower Mound	TX	75022
8	HR-OneSource	1011 Office Park Road	Suite 6	West Des Moines	IA	50265
9	Hughes, Perry & Associates	P.O. Box 384		Sea Ranch	CA	95497
10	Isaacson, Miller	334 Boylston Street	Suite 500	Boston	MA	02116
11	Koff & Associates, Inc.	18 Crow Canyon Court	Suite 165	San Ramon	CA	94583
12	Kuehl & Payer, Ltd.	1725 N. Lake Avenue	PO Box 458	Storm Lake	IA	50588
13	L. B. Hayhurst & Associates	27 Commercial Boulevard	Suite C	Novato	CA	94949
14	McGrath Consulting, Inc.	P.O. Box 190		Wonder Lake	IL	60097
15	Meng, Finseth & Associates	3858 Carson Street	Suite 202	Torrance	CA	90503
16	MMA Consulting Group, Inc.	41 West Street		Boston	MA	02111
17	Personnel Decisions, International	2000 Plaza VII Tower	45 South 7th Street	Minneapolis	MN	55402
18	Ralph Andersen & Assoc c/o C. Rohre	2210 Blue Cypress Drive		Richardson	TX	75082
19	Ralph Andersen & Associates	5800 Stanford Ranch Road	Suite 410	Rocklin	CA	95765
20	Resource Management Associates	17037 S. Oak Park Avenue		Tinley Park	IL	60477
21	Slavin Management Consultants, Inc.	3040 Holcomb Bridge Road	Suite B-1	Norcross	GA	30071
22	Springsted Incorporated	85 Seventh Place East	Suite 100	Saint Paul	MN	55101
23	The Brimeyer Group, Inc.	Fifty South Ninth Avenue	Suite 101	Hopkins	MN	55343
24	The Hawkins Company	5455 Wilshire Boulevard	Suite 1406	Los Angeles	CA	90036
25	The Mercer Group, Inc.	551 W. Cordova Road	#726	Santa Fe	NM	87505
26	The Mercer Group, Inc.	5579B Chamblee Dunwoody Road	Suite 511	Atlanta	GA	30338
27	The Mercer Group, Inc.	4520 W. 14th Street Drive		Greeley	CO	80634
28	The Mercer Group, Inc.	3133 Thomas Avenue	Suite A	Dallas	TX	75204
29	The Mercer Group, Inc.	P.O. Box 9328		Winter Haven	FL	33883
30	THE PAR GROUP (1)	100 N. Waukegan Road	Suite 211	Lake Bluff	IL	60044
31	The Prothman Company	126 NW Canal Street	Suite 210	Seattle	WA	98107
32	Oldani/Waters Consulting Group, Inc	2695 Villa Creek Drive	Suite 104	Dallas,	TX	75234
33	Waldron and Company	101 Stewart	Suite 1200	Seattle	WA	98101

NOT ON ORIGINAL DISTRIBUTION LIST BUT INCLUDED LATER (A, B & C) or, NOT ON DISTRIBUTION LIST BUT SUBMITTED A RFP (D, E & F)

A	Tuft & Associates	1209 North Astor Street		Chicago	IL	60610
B	Peckham & McKenney	6700 Freeport Boulevard	Suite 203A	Sacramento	CA	95822
C	The Kaleidoscope Group, LLC	434 West Ontario Street	Suite 200	Chicago	IL	60610
D	McPherson & Jacobson, LLC	P.O. Box 7346		Omaha	NE	68107
E	Virchow Krause & Co.	225 N. Michigan Ave	Suite 1100	Chicago	IL	60601
F	DHR International (1)	10 S. Riverside Plaza	Suite 2220	Chicago	IL	60606

Firms in **BOLD** submitted a RFP

Village Manager RFP Evaluation Grid

General Criteria	GROUP A			GROUP B			GROUP C			DHR International	
	Bennet Yarger	Mercer	Waters Oldani	CPS	PAR Group	Arcus	McPherson Jacobson	Gerald Plock	Virchow Krause		
1 Placement of City Managers (Y) or (N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	
References A. Provided the 5 Requested References (Y) or (N)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
B. Recent Village (City) Manager Placements (Placement, Year)	City Manager, Portage, MI; Town Manager, Arlington, MA; Village Manager, Haslings-on-Hudson, NY; Town Manager, Cohasset, MA; City Manager, Rye, NY; Town Manager, Weston, MA.	City Manager, City of Westminster, CO; City Manager, Centennial, CO; City Manager, Rockville, MD; City Manager, Norfolk, VA; City Manager, Federal Way, CO.	Assistant City Manager/Chief Financial Officer, Lubbock, TX; City Manager, Fort Collins, CO; City Manager, Ann Arbor, MI; Deputy County Administrator, Broward County, FL; City Manager, Plano, TX.	City Manager, Seaside, CA; City Manager, Moreno Valley, CA; City Manager, Mesa, AZ; City Manager, Lynwood, CA; City Manager, Arlington, TX.	City Manager/Administrator recruitments for Illinois municipalities of Flora, Glenview, Lake Barrington, Matteson, Moline, Oswego, Peoria, Plainfield, Rochelle, Salem and St. Charles	City Manager, San Antonio, TX; Assistant City Manager/Chief Information Officer, San Antonio, TX; Public Information Officer, City of Dallas, TX; Vice President of Development, Harrisburg University, Harrisburg, PA; Chief Technology Officer, Employee Retirement System of Texas, Austin, TX.	Superintendent, Independent School District 196, Rosemount, MN; Superintendent, Carlsbad Municipal Schools, Carlsbad, NM; Superintendent, Madison Parish School District, Tallulah, LA; Superintendent, East Windsor Regional School District, Hightstown, NJ; Superintendent, Bismarck Public Schools, Bismarck, ND	Police Chief, Brighton, MI; Executive, Human Relations Commission, Nashville, TN; City Engineer, City of Phoenix, AZ; Director of Development, City of Corpus Christi, TX; Cultural Services Director, San Antonio, TX	Village Manager, Whitefish Bay, WI; Village Administrator, Village of Pewaukee, WI; City Administrator, City of Oak Creek, WI; Finance Director, City of Freeport, IL; Police Chief and Fire Chief, City of Fond du Lac, WI	Michael Ley, Partner in Charge, Public Consulting Group	David Hoffman, Chairman and CEO
2											
3 Lead/Principal Staff in Charge of Project	Richard T. Bennett, Principal	James Mercer, President	Jerrold Oldani, Executive Vice President	Connie Champroise, CPS Regional Manager, Madison, WI	Robert Beezal, President	Scott Reilly, Vice President	No Specific Designation	Gerald R. Plock, President			
4 Fair Employment Practices	Not Specified	Not Specified	Not Specified	Y	Not Specified	Y	Not Specified	Not Specified	Not Specified	Not Specified	Not Specified
5 Cost	\$14,500	\$15,000	\$19,500	\$20,000	\$14,500	\$20,000	\$18,900	\$16,500	\$16,900	\$50,000	
A. Fee for Professional Services	\$5,500 (NM)	\$7,500 (Y)	Not Specified	\$8,000 (NM)	\$4,000 (N)	\$5,000 (Y)	\$9,600 (NM)	\$9,500 (NM)	Not Specified	Not Specified	
B. Expenses and whether they are capped (Y), (N) or not mention (NM)											

Village Manager RFP Evaluation Grid

General Criteria	GROUP A			GROUP B			GROUP C			DHR International
	Bennet Yarger	Mercer	Waters Oldani	CPS	PAR Group	Arcus	McPharson Jacobson	Gerald Plock	Virchow Krause	
MBE/WBE Status A. Firm is MBE/WBE (Y) or (N) B. Firm has partnered with MBE/WBE Firms On Other Projects (Y) or (N)	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Commitment to Diversity (Based on appointment of persons in protected classes)	Y (Strong)	Y	Y (Strong)	Y	No Data to Make Assessment	Y	Did not list gender and ethnicity of appointees	Y (Strong)	All Male White appointments	Y
Due Diligence Conducted on Candidates' Background and Credentials	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y (\$125 per candidate)	Y	Y	Y	Y (Minimal)	Y
Schedule for Completion of Tasks (Y) or (N); and Overall Length of Project	Y, 3 Months	N, 4 Months (inferred from information)	Y, 4 Months	Y, 4 Months	N, 3 Months	Y, 4 Months	N, 2/3 Months (inferred from information)	N	Y, 4 Months	N, 3 Months
Guarantee A. Will Identify New Applicant Pool if Initial Recruitment Fails to Identify Suitable Candidates (Y) or (N) B. Will Identify New Applicant Pool if Selected Candidate Vacates Position (Y) and Length of Guarantee or (N)	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	N	Y	N	N
	Y, 12 Months	Y, 24 Months	Y, 24 Months	Y, 12 Months	Y, 12 Months	Y, 12 Months	Y, 12 Months	N	N	Y, 24 Months